



www.figo.org

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

## International Journal of Gynecology and Obstetrics

journal homepage: [www.elsevier.com/locate/ijgo](http://www.elsevier.com/locate/ijgo)

## CLINICAL ARTICLE

## Causes and avoidable factors in maternal death due to cesarean-related hemorrhage in South Africa

Salome Maswime\*, Eckhart Buchmann

Wits Obstetrics and Gynaecology Clinical Research Division, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa



## ARTICLE INFO

## Article history:

Received 23 November 2015

Received in revised form 19 February 2016

Accepted 19 May 2016

## Keywords:

Bleeding during and after cesarean

Cesarean delivery

Maternal mortality

Postpartum hemorrhage

## ABSTRACT

**Objective:** To describe risk factors, clinical events, and avoidable factors in cases of maternal death due to bleeding during and after cesarean delivery. **Methods:** A retrospective study was undertaken of the clinical records of women who delivered in seven hospitals in Johannesburg, South Africa, between January 2013 and December 2014. Maternal deaths due to cesarean-related hemorrhage during or within 42 days of cesarean delivery at 24 weeks or more were selected. Case records were audited using quantitative techniques to determine the events leading up to death. **Results:** There were 123 251 deliveries and 17 maternal deaths due to bleeding during or after cesarean (3.2 deaths per 10 000 deliveries). Risk factors included previous cesarean delivery, preoperative anemia, and placental abruption. Uterine atony and surgical trauma were the main causes of bleeding. Five (29%) women died before the cause of bleeding was found. Avoidable factors included delays in the recognition and management of shock. Thirteen (76%) women died within 48 hours of the cesarean procedure. **Conclusion:** Deaths due to bleeding during and after cesarean have multifactorial causation. Maternal healthcare systems must be strengthened, with attention to the knowledge and skills of health workers. This requires increased clinical vigilance, a rapid effective response to obstetric hemorrhage and shock, and overall health system strengthening.

© 2016 International Federation of Gynecology and Obstetrics. Published by Elsevier Ireland Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

## 1. Introduction

Maternal deaths resulting from bleeding during and after cesarean have recently increased in South Africa: in the triennial report on confidential enquiries into maternal deaths in 2011–2013 [1], such bleeding accounted for more than one-third of maternal deaths due to obstetric hemorrhage [1]. The cause-specific case fatality rate for hemorrhage during cesarean delivery was 5.5 deaths per 10 000 cesareans performed [2]. More than 70% of the deaths were considered to be clearly avoidable [2].

An increasing rate of cesarean delivery is thought to be the main cause of the rising numbers of deaths due to cesarean-related hemorrhage in South Africa [2]. There is also concern about a lack of surgical skills to manage women with severe bleeding during and after cesarean [3]. A shortage of ambulances and appropriate referral systems is also a major concern [2,3]. Medical and nursing staff shortages, operating room backlogs, and emergency transport deficiencies are frequent challenges in local state-run health services in South Africa [4,5].

Nevertheless, maternal death due to bleeding during and after cesarean remains a rare outcome. To our knowledge, no case series has examined the clinical details and quality of care in this situation.

The aim of the present study was therefore to describe risk factors, clinical events, and potentially avoidable factors in cases of maternal death due to bleeding during and after cesarean.

## 2. Materials and methods

In a retrospective study, maternal deaths due to bleeding during and after cesarean that occurred at seven hospitals in Johannesburg, South Africa, between January 1, 2013, and December 31, 2014, were audited as a case series. Ethical approval was granted by the University of the Witwatersrand's Human Research Ethics Committee, and institutional permission for the study was obtained from the Gauteng Department of Health. Informed consent was not needed because it was a retrospective study of maternal death.

Three of the study hospitals are university teaching hospitals in Johannesburg with tertiary referral functions, and four are regional (secondary-level) hospitals as part of the local referral system. Hospitals in South Africa are required to keep all clinical notes in cases of maternal death. Therefore, all maternal death records were reviewed by a certified specialist obstetrician and gynecologist (S.M.) to identify the causes. Deaths due to bleeding during and after cesarean were selected for inclusion.

The case definition of maternal death due to bleeding during and after cesarean was death during or within 42 days of surgery resulting from acute hemorrhage of at least 1000 mL (as estimated and noted in

\* Corresponding author at: 116 Hill of Good Hope, 94 New Road, Midrand 1685, South Africa. Tel.: +27 764701169; fax: +27 119381534.

E-mail address: [smaswime@gmail.com](mailto:smaswime@gmail.com) (S. Maswime).

the file by the surgeon) during or after cesarean delivery at 24 weeks of pregnancy or more [6]. Women with medical disorders or blood clotting disorders were included, as were women with placental abruption, placenta previa, and/or placenta accreta. The exclusion criteria were uterine rupture with the fetus partially or completely extruded from the uterus, and advanced extrauterine pregnancy. Women for whom bleeding before cesarean was considered to be the primary cause of maternal death were also excluded from the audit. When there was difficulty in deciding on inclusion or exclusion of a case, two researchers (S.M. and E.B.) made a decision by consensus.

Risk factors considered in data collection included age and parity, previous cesarean delivery, prenatal anemia, HIV infection, placental disorders (abruption, previa, and accreta), breech presentation, multiple pregnancy, and prolonged labor. Obesity could not be estimated because of irregular recording of height. Anemia was defined as a hemoglobin level of less than 110 g/L [7]. Prolonged labor was defined as a latent phase of more than 8 hours in hospital or an active phase of first stage of more than 12 hours [8]. The type of hospital where the cesarean occurred and the rank of the surgeon (medical officer, resident, or specialist) were also considered. Other risk factors were time of operation (day or night), day on which the operation was performed (weekend or weekday), type of anesthesia, and birth weight.

Indications for cesarean, estimated blood loss, and interventions to arrest intraoperative hemorrhage were noted. Postoperative monitoring and management of postpartum hemorrhage (PPH) were also evaluated. The cause and site of the bleeding were determined from details in the medical notes and on the basis of the researcher's opinion. Difficult cases were discussed between the researchers. Details of the clinical and surgical management—especially blood transfusion, non-surgical methods to stop bleeding, compression sutures, hysterectomy, second-look laparotomy, and admission to the intensive care unit—were noted.

The Donabedian model was used to assess the quality of health care in each maternal death, looking for avoidable factors. The model supposes that the clinical outcome of a patient is influenced by health service structure (facility and resources where the outcome took place) and process (diagnosis and treatment by the healthcare workers) [9]. Avoidable factors were subdivided into process and structure. If there was a factor or factors that directly resulted in the death of a patient, then the death was deemed avoidable. Expected structure factors included blood transfusion delays, emergency transport failures, and operating room delays. Process factors included patient-related issues, such as nonattendance at prenatal clinics and refusing hospital treatment, and healthcare worker-related factors, such as failure to recognize, diagnose, and respond to intraoperative or postoperative bleeding, including deficits in routine monitoring, inadequate volume resuscitation, and failure to undertake actions to arrest hemorrhage or treat hypovolemic shock.

The study used quantitative techniques. Data were analyzed by Stata version 11 (StataCorp, College Station, TX, USA). Values were reported as mean  $\pm$  SD for normally distributed continuous data, median (range) for non-normally distributed continuous data, and number (percentage) for categorical data.

### 3. Results

During the study period, there were 17 maternal deaths due to bleeding during and after cesarean in the seven hospitals. In total, there were 123 251 deliveries at the hospitals, 43 137 (35%) of which were by cesarean. In 14 of the 17 included deaths, the woman underwent the cesarean delivery at one of the seven study hospitals, giving a case fatality rate of 3.2 deaths per 10 000 cesarean deliveries (14/43 137) at the seven hospitals. The other three women were transferred postoperatively from district hospitals because of bleeding complications.

The mean age of the 17 women was  $28.6 \pm 6.7$  years; two women were younger than 19 years, and three were older than 35 years (range 17–42). The median parity was two (range 0–6); there were

three primigravidas and two women with a parity of six before delivery. Four (24%) women had a previous cesarean delivery. Seven (41%) had a record of prenatal anemia. Fourteen (82%) women attended prenatal care. Four (24%) women were infected with HIV. Three (18%) cesarean procedures were done preterm ( $<37$  weeks). Three (18%) women had labor induced, and 1 (6%) had labor augmented with oxytocin. Three (18%) women underwent the cesarean before onset of labor, and 3 (18%) had the cesarean in the second stage of labor. There was 1 (6%) multiple pregnancy and 1 (6%) singleton breech presentation. Five (29%) women had placental abruption, and 1 (6%) had placenta accreta (Table 1). There were no cases of placenta previa.

All operations were performed by non-specialists, and two were done by residents in training. All 17 deaths were associated with potentially avoidable factors. Patient-related process factors included two women who did not attend prenatal care, and a woman with severe pre-eclampsia who refused hospital admission and cesarean delivery. This woman returned 5 days later with eclampsia, placental abruption, and a resistant atonic uterus with coagulopathy. Fourteen (82%) procedures were performed from Monday to Friday, and 3 (18%) were performed during a weekend. Fifteen (88%) cesareans were booked as emergencies, and 2 (12%) as elective. Seven (41%) procedures were done during the day, and 10 (59%) at night. Thirteen (76%) women had regional anesthesia. Stillbirth occurred in 7 (41%) cases. The mean birth weight was  $2518 \pm 882$  g (range 1270–3820).

Ten (59%) procedures were recorded as “difficult” by the operating surgeons. The median estimated blood loss was 750 mL (range 300–8000; unrecorded in two cases). Two (12%) women died during the operation. Seven women (41%) had blood transfusions during the cesarean procedure. Atonic uterus was the main cause of bleeding in 7 (41%) cases, including five women with placental abruption, followed by surgical trauma in 5 (29%) cases. The cause of bleeding remained unknown for 5 (29%) women, three of whom died in the postoperative wards before any life-saving intervention could be started.

Surgical interventions included hysterectomy during the cesarean procedure for 3 (18%) women, and B-Lynch compression suture for 1 (6%) woman. Nine (53%) women subsequently had second-look laparotomies, during which 4 (44%) women underwent a hysterectomy, and 1 (11%) woman had B-Lynch compression suture (Table 2). Balloon tamponade was not attempted in any case, nor was tranexamic acid injection used. Postoperative artificial ventilation was provided to 14 (82%) women and inotropic drugs to 15 (88%) women. Nine (53%) women were admitted to the intensive care unit. Thirteen (76%) women died within 48 hours of surgery.

Recurrent avoidable factors related to the health system included shortages of emergency blood and emergency transport, and operating room delays. Health-worker-related factors included cesarean procedures with no clinical indication (e.g. grand multiparity, and breech presentation with fetal death), failure to detect hypovolemic shock, failure to control bleeding and/or treat shock, prolonged labor with delayed intervention, and delay in performing second-look surgery (Table 3).

### 4. Discussion

The present study found a case fatality rate of 3.2 maternal deaths due to bleeding during and after cesarean per 10 000 cesarean procedures. This is lower than the national case fatality rate for hemorrhage during cesarean delivery (5.5 per 10 000 cesareans [2]), possibly because of the better skills and resources available in Johannesburg with its academic hospitals and socioeconomic advantages relative to the rest of South Africa. Recurring risk factors for maternal death in the present audit were prenatal anemia, placental abruption, previous cesarean delivery, and second stage of labor. Factors contributing to the deaths of these women included the perioperative management of hemorrhage by the healthcare worker and the healthcare facility. Pre-operative factors—e.g. delays in performing cesarean or non-indicated cesarean procedures—might also have had a causative role. Deaths

**Table 1**

Case profiles and risk factors for maternal death due to bleeding during or after cesarean delivery.

Case	Prenatal care	Previous cesarean	HIV infection	Hemoglobin, g/L <sup>a</sup>	Labor stage at time of cesarean	Labor prolonged	Abruptio placentae	Placenta accreta	Hospital level <sup>b</sup>
1	Yes	No	No	115	First	Yes	No	No	District
2	Yes	No	No	131	First	No	No	No	Tertiary
3	Yes	No	No	78	First	Yes	Yes	No	Regional
4	Yes	No	Yes	132	First	No	No	No	Tertiary
5	Yes	Yes	No	123	First	No	Yes	No	Tertiary
6	Yes	Yes	No	123	First	No	No	Yes	Regional
7	Yes	No	Yes	106	First	No	No	No	Regional
8	No	No	Yes	–	First	No	No	No	Regional
9	Yes	No	No	134	None	No	No	No	District
10	Yes	No	Yes	96	Second	Yes	No	No	District
11	Yes	No	No	116	First	Yes	No	No	Regional
12	No	No	No	–	None	No	Yes	No	Tertiary
13	Yes	No	No	72	First	No	Yes	No	Regional
14	No	No	No	–	Second	Yes	No	No	Regional
15	Yes	Yes	No	75	None	No	No	No	Regional
16	Yes	Yes	No	94	Second	Yes	No	No	Regional
17	Yes	No	No	108	First	Yes	Yes	No	Regional

<sup>a</sup> Indicates lowest prepartum hemoglobin level recorded (if prenatal care was attended).<sup>b</sup> Indicates the level of care at which the cesarean procedure was done (not necessarily where the death occurred). Three women were transferred from district hospitals after cesarean delivery.

due to bleeding during and after cesarean do not arise from an isolated event, but stem from multiple factors. The common situation was a cesarean procedure with a risk factor; followed by bleeding from surgical trauma or atonic uterus, then failure to diagnose and treat shock, with a delayed second-look operation with or without hysterectomy, and ultimately death after blood transfusion and intensive care.

Studies on PPH place emphasis on the so-called golden hour and on diagnosis and treatment of shock [10]. The golden hour is the time from the onset of PPH during which resuscitation needs to begin for the patient to receive maximum benefit. The longer it takes between the onset of shock and resuscitation, the lower the chance of patient survival. According to a meta-analysis of postpartum deaths in low-income countries and the USA [11], 45% of postpartum deaths occur within the first 24 hours of surgery. In the present study, 29% of the women died within the first 24 hours, and 47% died in the following 24 hours.

In terms of whether the deaths were related to the surgical skills of the surgeons involved, 59% of the procedures were recorded as “difficult” in the surgical notes. A second-look laparotomy was necessary for four of these difficult cesareans. South Africa faces the challenge of a shortage of skilled and specialist staff [3]. Cesarean procedures could also have become more difficult owing to the increasing rate of primary cesarean deliveries and the complications related to

subsequent repeat cesarean procedures [12]. There is a need to prepare non-specialist surgeons for difficult cesarean deliveries.

The use of prophylactic oxytocin during cesarean to prevent uterine atony was not always documented, and postoperative oxytocin in the postnatal ward was not always given. In South Africa, oxytocin should be given routinely irrespective of the mode of delivery [13]. The use of second-line uterotonic drugs was poor. One woman received ergometrine, three women received misoprostol, one had intramyometrial prostaglandin F2 $\alpha$ , and no woman was given tranexamic acid, despite evidence of its hemostatic efficacy [14]. The approach to arrest hemorrhage could have been more rapid and aggressive in most of the 17 cases. Frequently, too little was done too late.

Failure to detect and treat shock was a dominant theme in the case series. Appropriate basic monitoring and emergency responses could have been better. Special measures to predict shock, and interventions to treat shock, were not in place. The non-pneumatic anti-shock garment, currently not available in South Africa, is a compression suit worn around the lower extremities by patients in shock. It is a temporary option that has been shown to reduce PPH-related deaths and morbidity in settings where delays in the management of PPH are common [15]. The shock index, defined as the heart rate divided by the systolic blood pressure (up to 0.9 is normal in obstetric patients), has been

**Table 2**

Causes of bleeding during and after cesarean delivery, and emergency responses.

Case	Main cause of bleeding	Pharmacological intervention	Surgical intervention	Units of red cells transfused
1	Surgical trauma: uterine artery	–	Second-look surgery with B-Lynch	7
2	Unknown	–	None	0
3	Atonic uterus (placental abruption)	Oxytocin, misoprostol	Hysterectomy at cesarean	2
4	Surgical trauma: abdominal wall	–	Second-look surgery	7
5	Atonic uterus (placental abruption)	Oxytocin, misoprostol, intramyometrial prostaglandin F2 $\alpha$	None	9
6	Placental site (placenta accreta)	–	Hysterectomy at cesarean	7
7	Unknown	–	None	0
8	Unknown	–	Second-look surgery	3
9	Atonic uterus	Oxytocin	Second-look surgery with hysterectomy	7
10	Unknown	–	Second-look surgery with hysterectomy	5
11	Unknown	–	None	2
12	Atonic uterus (placental abruption)	Oxytocin	B-Lynch at cesarean	5
13	Atonic uterus (placental abruption)	Oxytocin	Second-look surgery	4
14	Surgical trauma: uterine incision	–	Second-look surgery	7
15	Surgical trauma: uterine artery <sup>a</sup>	Oxytocin	Second-look surgery with hysterectomy	10
16	Atonic uterus <sup>b</sup>	Oxytocin	Second-look surgery with hysterectomy	9
17	Atonic uterus (placental abruption)	Oxytocin, ergometrine	Hysterectomy at cesarean	2

<sup>a</sup> Complicated by atonic uterus.<sup>b</sup> Complicated by posterior uterine wall surgical trauma.

**Table 3**

Avoidable factors in maternal deaths due to bleeding during or after cesarean delivery.

Case	Structure factors (health system)	Process factors (patient, health worker)
1	Emergency transport delay; no beds available in intensive care unit	Failure to identify cause of hemorrhage
2	–	Cesarean delivery not indicated; inadequate postoperative observations
3	Shortage of blood for transfusion	Failure to treat anemia during prenatal care
4	Equipment failure: ventilator malfunction	Delayed decision to perform second-look surgery
5	No beds available in intensive care unit	Patient refused hospital admission
6	–	Poor prenatal care attendance by patient
7	–	Failure to detect shock and manage the hemorrhage
8	–	Patient did not attend prenatal care; patient did not go to referral hospital; cesarean delivery not indicated; failure to detect shock
9	Referral hospital delayed in accepting transfer of the patient	Delayed decision to perform second-look surgery
10	Shortage of blood for transfusion	Delayed decision to perform second-look surgery; delayed transfer of patient to higher level of care
11	–	Inadequate intrapartum monitoring and prolonged labor; failure to detect and manage shock
12	Emergency transport delay	Patient did not attend prenatal care; failure to resuscitate patient in shock
13	Delay in starting cesarean procedure	Delayed decision to perform second-look surgery
14	–	Patient did not attend prenatal care; delayed decision to perform second-look surgery
15	–	Failure to achieve hemostasis intraoperatively
16	Delay in starting cesarean procedure	Prolonged labor with delayed intervention
17	Delay in starting cesarean procedure	Poor intrapartum monitoring; failure to diagnose placental abruption preoperatively

shown to be an accurate predictor of compensatory changes in the cardiovascular system from hemorrhage [16]. In low-resource settings, it might be recommended as a better indicator of severity of PPH than blood loss estimation [17]. More emphasis on the diagnosis and management of shock is needed in such settings.

A limitation of the present study is the small number of patients; however, death due to bleeding during and after cesarean is rare and has not been studied sufficiently. The sample was adequate to show recurring healthcare worker and healthcare system deficiencies, although a case–control study with a control group of survivors (near-miss and uncomplicated births) would have given a better representation of why women die. Poor documentation in some of the clinical notes was also a limitation.

In conclusion, although death due to bleeding during and after cesarean is rare, it is alarming and mostly avoidable. Owing to its multifactorial causation, death due to bleeding during and after cesarean can be avoided only by strengthening health systems and increasing clinician knowledge and skills. Clinical managers must ensure recognition of risk factors, implementation of routine precautions, and a vigilant and systematic approach to the detection and treatment of obstetric hemorrhage and its effects.

### Acknowledgments

The research was supported by the Carnegie Corporation of New York (grant no. B8749.R01) and a Self-initiated Research Grant from the South African Medical Research Council.

### Conflict of interest

The authors have no conflicts of interest.

### References

- [1] South African Department of Health. Saving Mothers 2011–2013: Sixth report on the confidential enquiries into maternal deaths in South Africa. Pretoria: South African Department of Health; 2015.
- [2] Gebhardt G, Fawcus S, Moodley J, Farina Z. National Committee for Confidential Enquiries into Maternal Deaths in South Africa. Maternal death and caesarean section in South Africa: Results from the 2011–2013 Saving Mothers Report of the National Committee for Confidential Enquiries into Maternal Deaths. *S Afr Med J* 2015;105(4):287–91.
- [3] Pattinson R. Reducing direct causes of maternal death. *S Afr J Obstet Gynaecol* 2013; 19(3):59–60.
- [4] SECTION 27. Monitoring Our Health: An analysis of the breakdown of health care services in selected Gauteng facilities: A report for the period January–December 2012. <http://www.politicsweb.co.za/documents/the-gauteng-health-system-in-crisis-section27>. Published 2013. Accessed May 18, 2016.
- [5] RDM News Wire. Gauteng promised improved access to surgeries and more ambulances. <http://www.sowetanlive.co.za/news/2015/06/19/gauteng-promised-improved-access-to-surgeries-and-more-ambulances>. Published 2015. Accessed May 18, 2016.
- [6] World Health Organization. Beyond the numbers, reviewing maternal deaths and complications to make pregnancy safer. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2004.
- [7] Candio F, Hofmeyr GJ. Treatments for iron-deficiency anaemia in pregnancy. RHL commentary. [http://apps.who.int/rlh/pregnancy\\_childbirth/medical/anaemia/cfcom/en/](http://apps.who.int/rlh/pregnancy_childbirth/medical/anaemia/cfcom/en/). Published 2007. Accessed May 18, 2016.
- [8] World Health Organization. Managing prolonged and obstructed labour. World Health Organization. Education material for teachers of midwifery: Midwifery education modules. 2nd ed. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2008. p. 17.
- [9] Donabedian A. Evaluating the quality of medical care. *Milbank Q* 2005;83(4): 691–729.
- [10] Lalonde A, Daviss BA, Acosta A, Herschderfer K. Postpartum hemorrhage today: ICM/FIGO initiative 2004–2006. *Int J Gynecol Obstet* 2006;94(3):243–53.
- [11] Li XF, Fortney JA, Kotelchuck M, Glover LH. The postpartum period: the key to maternal mortality. *Int J Gynecol Obstet* 1996;54(1):1–10.
- [12] Lyell DJ. Adhesions and perioperative complications of repeat cesarean delivery. *Am J Obstet Gynecol* 2011;205(6 Suppl):S11–8.
- [13] South African Department of Health. Guidelines for maternity care in South Africa. A manual for clinics, community health centres and district hospitals. Pretoria: South African Department of Health; 2007.
- [14] Peitsidis P, Kadir RA. Antifibrinolytic therapy with tranexamic acid in pregnancy and postpartum. *Expert Opin Pharmacother* 2011;12(4):503–16.
- [15] Pileggi-Castro C, Nogueira-Pileggi V, Tuncalp O, Oladapo OT, Vogel JP, Souza JP. Non-pneumatic anti-shock garment for improving maternal survival following severe postpartum haemorrhage: a systematic review. *Reprod Health* 2015;12:28.
- [16] Dyer R, Vorster A, Arcache M, Vasco M. New trends in the management of postpartum haemorrhage. *S Afr J Anaesth Analg* 2014;20(1):44–7.
- [17] Nathan HL, El Ayadi A, Hezelgrave N, Seed P, Butrick E, Miller S, et al. Shock index: an effective predictor of outcome in postpartum haemorrhage? *BJOG* 2015;122(2): 268–75.